

Not All Weak Hadith Are Created Equal: Classifying Hadith by Narrator Reliability

Description

Bismillahi Wal Hamdullillah Was Salaatu Was Salaamu â□□ Alaa Rasoolillahi

Ammaa Baâ□□ d:

The Scholars of Hadeeth used to say (and still hold):

3. Weakness due to a narrator being discredited for problems in his Dhabt (His Precision)

It should be known that the main way the early scholars of hadeeth would ascertain the dhabt or precision of a narrator is by comparing their narrations with the narrations of the trustworthy scholars known for their precision.

If he is well-known for agreeing with the trustworthy narrators in his narrations and that his narrations rarely opposing theirs and rarely differ then he is considered precise.

If his narrations agree with the narrations of the trustworthy, but on occasions his narrations oppose them then the scholars would pass a verdict upon him that he is of a lesser level of precision than the well-known so he is considered â□□ Hasanâ□□ in hadeeth and they would use descriptive words that would indicate that.

If though, his narrations oppose their narrations to the extent that it is said his opposition to them is greater than his agreement with them he is considered weak and his narrations are rejected outright, though it maybe that he is described as being â□□ mimman yuktab

hadeethuhuâ (from those who ahaadeeth may be written down) that is since his weakness may not be severe his hadeeth may be considered as ahaadeeth that may be used to support ahaadeeth of their like.

As for if his oppositions are gross and he rarely agrees with the trustworthy, he is declared â Faahishul Ghalatâ (Severe in making errors)â , his ahaadeeth are abandoned and are not even written down for consideration.

Thus:

from the Categories of weak hadeeth that relate to dhabt (Precision):

1. **Al Munkar (Ø§Ù Ù Ù Ù Ø±)**: It is that hadeeth wherein a **weak** narrator opposes in his narration those who are trustworthy or that a weak narrator is alone in narrating a hadeeth.

This category of weak hadeeth differs from the hadeeth Ash Shaadh in that the Shaadh revolves around the trustworthy narrator opposing the trustworthy, the Munkar revolves around the weak narrator opposing the trustworthy

We must always bear in mind that the scholars of hadeeth usually had many students and many teachers. Therefore whenever we have a hadeeth being narrated from an Imaam, then there will usually be from the students of that same Imaam, a student who would have narrated the same hadeeth at some time. Thus when a narrator, who the scholars of hadeeth discover weakness with him in narration, is alone in narrating a hadeeth, and no one from his trustworthy contemporaries have agreed with him in narrating this hadeeth, or none of them narrate it in that manner then this is a cause for concern.

Imaam Abdur Rahmaan Ibn Mahdi â Rahimahullah mentioned as occurs in â Al Jarhi Wat Taâ deelâ of Ibn Abi Haatim (1/1/38):

â *I memorize (i.e. Hadeeth) from a man who is Haafidh (a Great scholar of hadeeth well-known for his strong memory) and â Mutqinâ (A precise memorizor), this individual no one will differ about him (i.e. whether or not to take from him etc). And (i take) from another (narrator) who may make mistakes but for the most part his ahaadeeth are sound and authentic, then the hadeeth of this individual is not left, for if one were to leave his hadeeth then many of the hadeet of the people would go (i.e be lost due to them being abandoned). Then another makes mistakes and the bulk of his narrations are erroneous, then the ahadeeth of this individual are left*..â

An example of a hadeeth Munkar:

Imaam Ahmad mentions in his Musnad (1/195) upon the authority of An Nadhar Ibn Shaibaan who said : â *I said to Abi Salamah â Narrate to me something you heard your father narrating from The Messenger of Allah â Sallallahu â Alaihi Was Salam. (So) He said My Father narrated to me concerning the month of Ramadhaan He said the Messenger of Allah â Sallallahu â Alahi Was Salam said*:

â ***Indeed Allah â Azza Wa Jall â has made fasting the month of Ramadhaan compulsory upon you, and I have left as a Sunnah for you (the establishment of) Prayer. Thus whosoever fasts it and prays throughout it, believing in it and seeking the reward (for that from Allah) he exits from his sins as the day his mother gave birth to him***â

In is chain Is An Nadhr Ibn Shaibaan and he is a weak narrator and he has erred in the narration of this hadeeth. He narrates it from Abu Salamah Narrating from his father, thought the scholars hold Abu Salamah did not hear from his father, this is the first issue of opposition making the hadeeth Munkar. The second issue is that the hadeeth has been narrated by upright trustworthy strong narrators (Such as Yahya Ibn Saâ eed, Az Zuhri, and Yahya Ibn Abi Katheer who narrate it from Abu Salamah, not from his father but from Abu Hurairah with the wording

â ***Whosoever fasts Ramadhaan having Imaan in it and seeking the reward for that from Allah, his past sins will be forgiven. And prays On laylatul Qadr believing in it and seeking the reward for it from Allah, his past sins will be forgiven***

Thus An Nadhr Ibn Shaibaan opposed the trustworthy narrators in both the chain of transmission and in the text of the hadeeth (only one of those forms of opposition is needed for it to be considered Munkar, here we have two!) thus it is rejected.

2.**Ash Shaadh (Ø§Ù Ø´Ø§Ø°)**: The Hadeeth As Shaadh is defined as: â the trustworthy narrator opposing those who are more trustworthy than himâ , thus in essence the hadeeth Ash Shaadh is the similar to the Hadeeth Al Munkar except that with the shaadh the narrator is trustworthy but opposes those more trustworthy than him.

3. **Al Mudraj (Ø§Ù Ù Ø¯Ø±Ø¬)**: This is a reference to a hadeeth that has in it wording from one of the narrators of the hadeeth, this wording was heard by one of that narrators students and he presumed that it was part of the hadeeth itself and so it was added to the

text of the hadeeth while it is not actually from it

This usually occurs when a narrator hears his Shaikh narrating a hadeeth, and in the course of his narration, the Shaikh mentions an explanatory statement that one of those who were present presumed was from the wording of the hadeeth, when in actuality it was the statement of the narrator.

This â Idraajâ occurs at the beginning of the hadeeth (which is very rare), in the middle of the hadeeth (which again is quite rare) or at the end of the hadeeth (which is the most common).

Examples of this:

1. **In the beginning of the hadeeth**:

That which was collected by Al Khateeb Al Baghdaadi by way of Abu Qatan and Shabaabah who both narrated from Shuâ bah who narrated from Muhammad Ibn Ziyaad who narrated from Abu Hurairah who said: The Messenger of Allah â Sallallahu â Alaihi Was Salam Said: â ***Perfect the Wudhoo!, Woe to the heels from the hellfire***â

The statement â ***Perfect the wudhoo***!â are actually the words of Abu Hurairah and this is indicated by that which was collected by Imaamul Bukhaari in his â Saheehâ upon the authority of Aadam who narrated from Shuâ bah who narrated from Muhammad Ibn Ziyaad who narrated from Abu Hurairah (thus Aadam (who is Aadam Ibn Abi Iyaas), Abu Qatan and Shabaabah all took from the same narrator in this hadeeth, namely Imaam Shuâ bah â Rahimahullah) who said: â Perfect the wudhoo! for indeed Abul Qaasim said: â Woe to the heels from the hellfire!â

Thus we see that the version of Bukhaari makes it clear that they are actually Abu Hurairahs words.

2. **In the middle of the hadeeth**:

That which was collected by Imaamun Nasaaâ ee in his Sunan (6/21) by way of: Ibn Wahb who said it was narrated to be by Abu Haani upon the authority of Amr Ibn Maalik Al Janabi that he heard Fudhaalah Ibn Ubaid say: â I heard the Messenger of Allah â Sallallahu â alaihi Was Salam say:â ***I am the â Zaâ eemâ (Guarantor) â and the â Zaâ eemâ (meaning) the â Hameelâ (warrantor) â for the one who believes in me, embraces (Islaam) and migrates of a house in the outskirts of Paradise and a house in the middle of***

paradise..â□□

Here the statement The ***â□□ the â□□ Zaâ□□ eemâ□□ (meaning) the â□□ Hameelâ□□*** is actually from the words of the narrator Ibn Wahb

3.**At the end of the Hadeeth**

That which is collected by Ibn Abi Haatim in his â□□ Illalâ□□ (1/65) from the hadeeth of Ibraaheem Ibn Tahmaan who narrated from Hishaam Ibn Hasaan who narrated from Muhammad Ibn Seereen who narrated from Abu Hurairah and (a second chain of narration beginning with Ibraaheem) who (also) narrated from Sahl Ibn Abi Saalih from his father from Abu Hurairah who said The Messenger of Allah â□□ Sallallahu â□□ Alaihi Was Salam said: â□□ ***If one of you rises from his sleep then let him wash his hands three times before he immerses them into his vessel (of water, meaning he washes his hands externally then immerses them into his vessel of water) for indeed he does not know where his hand has spent the night, then let him scoop with his right hand from the vessel and let its contents pour upon his left then let him wash his rear end***â□□

Abu Haatim mentioned:

â□□ *What is befitting (and correct) is that the statement â□□ ..then let him scoop with his right hand from the vessel and let its contents pour upon his left then let him wash his rear endâ□□ is attributed to Ibraaheem Ibn Tahmaan, for indeed he connected his statement to the end of the hadeeth and those who heard (the hadeeth from him) did not make a distinction*â□□

Wallahu Aâ□□ lam

@abuhakeembilal

Category

1. Hadeeth
2. The Scholars

Date
11/18/2026
Date Created
10/02/2013